

# Key Debates in Anthropology

Edited by Tim Ingold



London and New York

# Contents

<i>Preface</i>		ix
General introduction		1
<i>Tim Ingold</i>		
<b>1988 debate</b>	<b>Social anthropology is a generalizing science or it is nothing</b>	15
Introduction		17
<i>Tim Ingold</i>		
Part I	The presentations	21
	For the motion (1)	21
	<i>Keith Hart</i>	
	Against the motion (1)	26
	<i>Anthony P. Cohen</i>	
	For the motion (2)	30
	<i>Anthony Good</i>	
	Against the motion (2)	36
	<i>Judith Okely</i>	
Part II	The debate	41
<b>1989 debate</b>	<b>The concept of society is theoretically obsolete</b>	55
Introduction		57
<i>Tim Ingold</i>		

<b>Part I</b>	<b>The presentations</b>	<b>60</b>
	For the motion (1)	60
	<i>Marilyn Strathern</i>	
	Against the motion (1)	67
	<i>J. D. Y. Peel</i>	
	For the motion (2)	72
	<i>Christina Toren</i>	
	Against the motion (2)	76
	<i>Jonathan Spencer</i>	
<b>Part II</b>	<b>The debate</b>	<b>83</b>
<b>1990 debate</b>	<b>Human worlds are culturally constructed</b>	<b>99</b>
Introduction		101
	<i>Roy Ellen</i>	
<b>Part I</b>	<b>The presentations</b>	<b>105</b>
	For the motion (1)	105
	<i>Wendy James</i>	
	Against the motion (1)	112
	<i>Tim Ingold</i>	
	For the motion (2)	118
	<i>Roland Littlewood</i>	
	Against the motion (2)	123
	<i>Paul Richards</i>	
<b>Part II</b>	<b>The debate</b>	<b>129</b>
<b>1991 debate</b>	<b>Language is the essence of culture</b>	<b>147</b>
Introduction		149
	<i>Tim Ingold</i>	
<b>Part I</b>	<b>The presentations</b>	<b>154</b>
	For the motion (1)	154
	<i>David Parkin</i>	

	Against the motion (1) <i>Alfred Gell</i>	159
	For the motion (2) <i>Brian Moeran</i>	166
	Against the motion (2) <i>James F. Weiner</i>	171
Part II	The debate	176
<b>1992 debate</b>	<b>The past is a foreign country</b>	199
Introduction		201
	<i>Tim Ingold</i>	
Part I	The presentations	206
	For the motion (1) <i>David Lowenthal</i>	206
	Against the motion (1) <i>Gillian Feeley-Harnik</i>	212
	For the motion (2) <i>Penelope Harvey</i>	218
	Against the motion (2) <i>Susanne Küchler</i>	224
Part II	The debate	229
<b>1993 debate</b>	<b>Aesthetics is a cross-cultural category</b>	249
Introduction		251
	<i>James F. Weiner</i>	
Part I	The presentations	255
	For the motion (1) <i>Howard Morphy</i>	255
	Against the motion (1) <i>Joanna Overing</i>	260
	For the motion (2) <i>Jeremy Coote</i>	266

viii *Contents*

	Against the motion (2) <i>Peter Gow</i>	271
Part II	The debate	276
<i>Index</i>		294